

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATE OF FLORIDA  
FLORIDA A&M UNIVERSITY

IN RE:                                   AUDIT & COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE MEETING  
DATE:                                    MARCH 3, 2016  
TIME:                                    10:04 a.m. - 10:26 a.m.  
COMMITTEE MEMBERS:                TRUSTEE NICOLE T. WASHINGTON, CHAIR  
(PRESENT)                            TRUSTEE ROBERT WOODY  
  TRUSTEE TONNETTE GRAHAM  
LOCATION:                                PRESIDENT'S CONFERENCE ROOM  
  FOURTH FLOOR  
  LEE HALL  
REPORTED BY:                           YVONNE LAFLAMME, FPR  
  COURT REPORTER and  
  NOTARY PUBLIC

C & N REPORTERS  
CERTIFIED PROFESSIONAL REPORTERS  
P.O. BOX 3093  
TALLAHASSEE, FLORIDA 32315  
(850) 697-8314

1 \*\*\*\*\*

2 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Good morning, everyone.

3 This is the special meeting for the Audit and  
4 Compliance Committee. We are pending one additional  
5 trustee coming on the line, so if you could please  
6 have patience with us for a couple of minutes while we  
7 try to locate people to make sure we have a quorum.

8 Thank you.

9 TRUSTEE LAWSON: Excuse me. We're waiting on  
10 Trustee Graham; is that the situation?

11 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Yeah.

12 TRUSTEE LAWSON: You can start the meeting but  
13 just not close it until you get a quorum. But as the  
14 chair, it's your decision.

15 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay. Well, thank you for  
16 that, Trustee Lawson.

17 I will hope -- I would begin and hope that we can  
18 get Trustee Graham on before we actually close, so I  
19 am going to call the meeting, the special meeting of  
20 Audit and Compliance Meeting or Committee to order.

21 Ms. Barrington, can you please call the roll?

22 MS. BARRINGTON: Good morning to everyone.  
23 Trustee Nicole Washington?

24 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Here.

25 MS. BARRINGTON: Trustee Tonnelle Graham?

1 Trustee Gary McCoy?

2 Trustee Craig Reed?

3 Trustee Robert Woody?

4 TRUSTEE WOODY: Here.

5 MS. BARRINGTON: Chair Washington, we do not have  
6 a quorum.

7 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you, Ms. Barrington.

8 MS. BARRINGTON: You're welcome.

9 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: And I am aware we do not  
10 have a quorum. We are trying to locate one of the  
11 other trustees to insure that we do have a quorum  
12 before taking this vote.

13 This should be a relatively short meeting. We  
14 only have one action item. It is, in fact, the  
15 acceptance of the performance-based funding data  
16 integrity report. It's -- this report is required by  
17 the Board of Governors. It was distributed to the  
18 committee members and the full board for your review  
19 prior to the meeting, and I would now ask VP Givens to  
20 give a review of the report.

21 VP GIVENS: Good morning.

22 TRUSTEE WOODY: Good morning.

23 VP GIVENS: This audit is required by the Board  
24 of Governors. It's required of all of the State  
25 University System universities, and it's -- the goal

1 is to provide the Board of Governors with the  
2 assurance that it wants to insure that the data it  
3 receives from the universities, that they rely upon  
4 for performance-funding based metric is accurate and  
5 complete.

6 So, we performed the audit. We have issued the  
7 report, and the conclusion of the audit is the  
8 University does have adequate processes and controls  
9 in place and the data submitted to the Board of  
10 Governors for performance funding metrics was accurate  
11 and complete.

12 In doing the audit, we did have a couple of  
13 observations. The first of these had to do with we  
14 noted that there was some inappropriate or unnecessary  
15 IT access privileges within the iRattler system. And  
16 corrective action on this has already been implemented  
17 or has begun, and the ITS subject matters experts are  
18 working with the users from the various offices to  
19 determine what access is needed for each level of duty  
20 and then a metric will be developed to include an  
21 appropriate set of duties.

22 The second step would then be to do an annual  
23 user roll recertification project, which would include  
24 completion of the testing application; and then  
25 secondly, to review and update the description of

1 access rules with the subject matter experts and then  
2 to execute an annual test, which would generate  
3 reports, so that it would be done on an annual basis.  
4 The implementation of this step is expected to be  
5 completed in October of 2016.

6 The second observation was data submissions were  
7 not submitted by the required due date in certain  
8 instances. Corrective action plans have already begun  
9 on this observation as well by providing training to  
10 those who input data with the expectation that they  
11 put down on the amount of input errors, and also  
12 consider maintaining some space facility in PeopleSoft  
13 rather than Legacy to expedite pulling that  
14 information out of that system. The implementation  
15 date of this is expected to be summer term of 2016.

16 We also noted in connection with the late  
17 submission of reports that the University could  
18 automate some processes which would help the data and  
19 been able to provide the data on a timely basis and  
20 cut down errors.

21 So, the next step would be for the Audit  
22 Committee to accept the report, and then they will go  
23 to the full board at the next meeting for acceptance  
24 by the full board, and then the report will be  
25 submitted to the Board of Governors.

1 Madam Chairman, that concludes my report.

2 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you very much,  
3 VP Givens. I'm just going to take a point of  
4 privilege to note there is a lot of feedback on the  
5 line, so I don't know -- if you're not speaking, if  
6 you could mute your line. Or if there's mumbling  
7 going on around the conference table, if you could  
8 keep that to a minimum.

9 Thank you.

10 So I just have one question. VP Givens, it's my  
11 understanding that this is the second year for the  
12 observations that you mentioned; is that correct?

13 THE WITNESS: Yes, that's correct.

14 Yes, that's correct.

15 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: That is correct. So both,  
16 we have the data integrity issues and the --  
17 (unintelligible) -- issues last year.

18 If it's possible, if there's somebody from the  
19 Provost's Office, could you explain how or what  
20 happened that these were not corrected last year?

21 DR. PALM: I'm sorry. Again, this is Donald  
22 Palm. Can you repeat your question?

23 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: I just asked what happened  
24 last -- this is the second year of these corrections,  
25 and I'm not sure if there's any penalties or anything,

1 but I'm just trying to figure out what happened last  
2 year that we did not in fact make the corrective  
3 action last year in that we had these findings again  
4 for the second year?

5 DR. PALM: Okay. So, with the data integrity, we  
6 actually switched from last year and this year to a  
7 new system, especially with regards to our student  
8 hours-to-degree file, and we're using our academic  
9 advisement module for that. And so this year --  
10 again, some of the issues were that all of the  
11 departments were not utilizing the academic advisement  
12 module, and so a directive went out from the Provost's  
13 Office last week -- excuse me, this week -- to provide  
14 training for those departments that are not utilizing  
15 academic advisement module.

16 This academic advisement module will insure the  
17 accuracy of our students, who degree audits were done,  
18 and it was creating a lot of issues with -- and there  
19 were various issues for the various students, but it  
20 was due to the fact that we switched over to an  
21 academic advisement module that will be utilized for  
22 the hours of degree file.

23 Now, last year, that was not in place and so some  
24 of the errors actually have decreased. But again, the  
25 reason for this year was the fact that all of the

1 various departments were not utilizing this academic  
2 advisement module to do the degree audits for our  
3 students. And so we know who those departments are,  
4 we have identified them, and we're providing training  
5 for those various departments.

6 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay. And then that was one  
7 issue, and then the second was the data or the folks  
8 having inappropriate access to the data. Can you  
9 speak to that?

10 DR. PALM: Yeah.

11 VP GIVENS: That's more of an issue for the  
12 finance and administration; rather, the Provost  
13 doesn't oversee those areas.

14 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay.

15 VP GIVENS: I can say this. When we did the  
16 audit, we talked with ITS personnel that they have  
17 started working on this already. They have removed  
18 some inappropriate access already where they were easy  
19 to identify. So say someone was no longer in a  
20 position, and so now they're able to do that. And now  
21 they're into the more time-consuming part of going  
22 through and identifying the users, not only within a  
23 particular department but also users outside of that  
24 department who may have some access to a particular  
25 role. Just to evaluate who needs what type of access



1 to do their job. So that -- they are in the process  
2 on that.

3 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay. Thank you.

4 TRUSTEE WOODY: Madam Chair, this is Trustee  
5 Woody.

6 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Yes, Trustee Woody?

7 TRUSTEE WOODY: Question for VP Givens. Have we  
8 started the training? Has staff started training on  
9 all of the corrective actions and the new procedures  
10 or new process?

11 VP GIVENS: Yes. As a matter of fact, as far as  
12 the system for the academic advising, I believe most  
13 departments have already undergone the training. So  
14 they're redoubling that effort, and with the Provost's  
15 backing, they will start using that system. And we  
16 recognize it's not going to be a painless effort,  
17 because they -- to get the information in the academic  
18 advising module it has to be accurate, it has to be  
19 verified so that when they run the graduation checks  
20 it provides good information.

21 But I will say, by doing that, it's going to  
22 provide a couple of more benefits that affect the  
23 performance metric in that it will give the advisors  
24 an ongoing way to monitor progress, and it will give  
25 the students to look at their progress and see how

1 they're going towards graduation.

2 TRUSTEE WOODY: So we're comfortable -- are you  
3 comfortable with the recommendation that you've made  
4 as it relates to the audit results?

5 VP GIVENS: Yes.

6 TRUSTEE WOODY: Okay.

7 VP GIVENS: And I believe that everybody involved  
8 that's got a role in providing the corrective actions  
9 have started working on it.

10 TRUSTEE WOODY: One last question, though. I  
11 think I already know this answer but maybe I want to  
12 hear someone say it.

13 Who is ultimately going to be responsible to make  
14 sure that the correction action is done and the  
15 training is done and the information is correct in the  
16 system?

17 VP GIVENS: Well, the departments are the ones  
18 responsible for implementing and we -- I shouldn't say  
19 "we" -- the Division of Audit and Compliance should do  
20 a follow-up. And in the process of developing an  
21 ongoing way to follow-up on all of the audit findings,  
22 where we will be providing to the senior leadership  
23 team a list of outstanding findings. And Dr. Mangum  
24 has indicated that she intends to follow-up with the  
25 responsible people to be sure that action is being

1 taken and it's not just going to be put on the back  
2 burner.

3 TRUSTEE WOODY: Okay, thank you.

4 Thank you, Madam Chair.

5 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you, Trustee Woody.

6 Any other questions?

7 TRUSTEE GRABLE: Madam Chair, this is Trustee  
8 Grable. I'm not on the committee but I have a  
9 question.

10 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Are you recognized Trustee  
11 Grable. Good morning.

12 TRUSTEE GRABLE: Good morning and thank you,  
13 Trustee Washington.

14 My question is for Vice President Givens. I, of  
15 course, I have great confidence in Vice President  
16 Givens -- shocked -- but I did want to ask when we  
17 look around the State University System, it's the norm  
18 that we use our internal auditors to do the work on  
19 making sure that this data is valid and reliable?

20 VP GIVENS: Yeah, I think typically that's done  
21 by the internal auditors. I believe there's one  
22 University, Florida Gulf Coast University, is the only  
23 one that hires an external firm to come in and do the  
24 audit just because they don't have sufficient staff to  
25 do it. Because this audit takes quite a bit of hours.

1 We have probably spent about 2500 hours on the audit  
2 to do it. But as far as I know, there's only one  
3 university that goes outside to have the audit done.

4 TRUSTEE GRAHAM: Good morning. This is Trustee  
5 Graham. I apologize for my delay. I am leaving a  
6 doctor's appointment.

7 TRUSTEE GRABLE: And Trustee Washington, I had  
8 one follow-up to that?

9 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Sure, Trustee Grable.  
10 Welcome, Trustee Graham.

11 TRUSTEE GRABLE: I'm curious, once we submit this  
12 to the Board of Governors, do they have processes in  
13 place where they then in turn verify what we submit?  
14 And I would like to know how that works.

15 VP GIVENS: Yeah. They could have a process.  
16 They review reports, and last year they called and had  
17 questions on a couple of issues -- primarily when we  
18 reported the inappropriate access last year -- and we  
19 provided some information as to how we evaluated that  
20 in terms of reaching our conclusion that the data is  
21 accurate and they were satisfied with it.

22 So they review reports and they -- there has been  
23 some talk within the Board of Governors' Audit  
24 Committee that the Board of Governors Inspector  
25 General may come do work paper inspections as well to

1 just insure that the work that's being done is meeting  
2 the specifications that they intended and that is  
3 accurate. Now, they have not done that to my  
4 knowledge, but they have indicated that is a  
5 possibility.

6 TRUSTEE GRABLE: So for this current report?

7 VP GIVENS: That's correct, yes.

8 TRUSTEE GRABLE: All-righty.

9 Thank you, Trustee Washington.

10 And thank you, VP Givens.

11 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you, Trustee Grable.

12 Do we have any other questions before the committee?

13 I take that as a no.

14 Ms. Barrington, can you do the roll one more time  
15 to verify that we have a quorum?

16 MS. BARRINGTON: Yes, ma'am, thank you.

17 Trustee Washington?

18 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Here.

19 MS. BARRINGTON: Trustee Graham? Trustee Graham?

20 TRUSTEE WOODY: She's not on the committee.

21 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: She is on the committee.

22 TRUSTEE WOODY: She is?

23 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Yes. She was just here.

24 MS. BARRINGTON: Trustee Graham?

25 Trustee McCoy?

1 Trustee Reed?

2 Trustee Woody.

3 TRUSTEE WOODY: Here.

4 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: All right. We need Trustee  
5 Graham, and then we will have a quorum, and then we  
6 can take a motion. Can we try to locate her? Did she  
7 drop off of the call? Do we know?

8 DR. STARLING: Yeah, she dropped off of the call.

9 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Trustee Graham, are you  
10 there? Vice Chair Lawson, if we cannot get Trustee  
11 Graham --

12 TRUSTEE LAWSON: Yeah, if we can't get Trustee  
13 Graham, because she's an official member of your  
14 committee, we will have to suspend the activity and  
15 then we will have to take up your committee meeting at  
16 the body meeting, next week, and then bring this item  
17 before with the motion, second, and a full vote.

18 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay. I just heard from  
19 Trustee Graham that she is trying to dial in.

20 TRUSTEE LAWSON: Okay, well, we can wait a minute  
21 for her to dial in.

22 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you all for your  
23 patience.

24 MS. BURY: She's back on now.

25 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Okay, Ms. Barrington, can

1       you call the roll one more time?

2           MS. BARRINGTON: Yes, ma'am.

3           Trustee Washington?

4           TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Here.

5           MS. BARRINGTON: Trustee Graham?

6           TRUSTEE GRAHAM: Here.

7           MS. BARRINGTON: Trustee McCoy?

8           Trustee Reed?

9           Trustee Woody?

10          TRUSTEE WOODY: Here.

11          MS. BARRINGTON: Chair Washington, we now have a  
12 quorum.

13          TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you, Ms. Barrington.

14          MS. BARRINGTON: You're welcome.

15          TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: And thank you, VP Givens for  
16 your thorough review and committee members. And  
17 others for all of your comments, if there are no other  
18 questions or comments, can I have a motion to accept  
19 this report?

20          TRUSTEE GRAHAM: So moved.

21          TRUSTEE WOODY: Second.

22          TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Thank you.

23          Moved by Trustee Graham and seconded by Trustee  
24 Moore. Are there any other discussions before the  
25 committee?

1 TRUSTEE WOODY: Woody.

2 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: Trustee Woody, sorry. My  
3 apologies.

4 TRUSTEE WOODY: No problem.

5 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: All in favor say "aye."

6 (All answer affirmatively.)

7 TRUSTEE WASHINGTON: All opposed, like sign? The  
8 motion carries.

9 Is there any other business to come before the  
10 committee that concludes our formal agenda? If there  
11 is no other business before the committee, the Audit  
12 Committee is adjourned.

13 (Meeting adjourned.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

STATE OF FLORIDA)  
COUNTY OF LEON)

I, Yvonne LaFlamme, Florida Professional Reporter  
and Notary Public, certify that I was authorized to and  
did stenographically report the foregoing proceeding; and  
that the transcript is a true and complete record of my  
stenographic notes.

I further certify that I am not a relative,  
employee, attorney, or counsel of any of the parties, nor  
am I a relative or employee of any of the parties'  
attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I  
financially interested in the outcome of this case.

Dated this 9th day of APRIL 2016.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Yvonne LaFlamme, FPR  
Court Reporter  
Notary Public  
State of Florida at Large

